

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

**IN RE: JOHNSON & JOHNSON TALCUM  
POWDER PRODUCTS MARKETING,  
SALES PRACTICES, AND PRODUCTS  
LIABILITY LITIGATION**

**MDL No. 3:16-md-02738-MAS-RLS**

**JUDGE MICHAEL A. SHIPP  
MAG. JUDGE RUKHSANAH L. SINGH**

MELA WILBURN,

Plaintiff,

v.

JOHNSON & JOHNSON, JOHNSON  
& JOHNSON CONSUMER, INC.  
F/K/A JOHNSON & JOHNSON  
CONSUMER COMPANIES, INC.,

Defendants.

**Civil Action No.: 3:19-cv-06857**

**RESPONSE TO AUGUST 15, 2024 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE (DKT. 33096)**

Melanie Meneses Palmer of Kiesel Law LLP, counsel of record for Plaintiff Mela Wilburn (hereinafter, "Plaintiff"), submits the following Response to the Court's August 15, 2024 Order to Show Cause Why Cases on the Attached Exhibit A Should Not Be Dismissed With Prejudice (Dkt. 33096).

Upon the submission of her verified Plaintiff Profile Form on February 23, 2024, Plaintiff resolved her delinquency status. Defendants acknowledged the resolution of Plaintiff's delinquency status. See **Exhibit 1**. Accordingly, the Order to Show Cause should be discharged as to Plaintiff and her case should not be dismissed.

///

///

DATED: September 5, 2024

Respectfully Submitted,

By: /s/ Melanie Meneses Palmer

Melanie Meneses Palmer

**KIESEL LAW LLP**

8648 Wilshire Boulevard

Beverly Hills, California 90211

Tel.: (310) 854-4444

Fax: (310) 854-0812

E-mail: [palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)

*Counsel for Plaintiff*

# **EXHIBIT 1**

**From:** [Garrett, Sean C.](#)  
**To:** [Melanie Palmer](#)  
**Cc:** [Sylvia Mendoza](#); [Christian Ceragioli](#); [Andrulyte, Emilija](#)  
**Subject:** RE: MDL 2738: Talcum Powder Litigation- PPF Submissions  
**Date:** Wednesday, July 17, 2024 6:50:34 AM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)

---

Hi Melanie,

Yes, I will take that matter off my list as well.

Thanks

**Sean C. Garrett**

Associate

[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)

Connect: [vCard](#)

+1 973 549 7094 direct

[Faegre Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP](#)

600 Campus Dr.

Florham Park, New Jersey 07932, USA

This message and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and/or privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

---

**From:** Melanie Palmer <[palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 10, 2024 7:47 PM

**To:** Garrett, Sean C. <[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)>

**Cc:** Sylvia Mendoza <[smendoza@kiesel.law](mailto:smendoza@kiesel.law)>; Christian Ceragioli <[cceragioli@kiesel.law](mailto:cceragioli@kiesel.law)>; Andrulyte, Emilija <[emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com](mailto:emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com)>

**Subject:** RE: MDL 2738: Talcum Powder Litigation- PPF Submissions

**This Message originated outside your organization.**

---

Hi Sean,

Thanks for removing the *Marrache* matter from the recent deficiency list submitted on June 21, 2024 (Doc 32850). In reviewing the list, however, we saw that Mela Wilburn's case was mistakenly included. A verified PPF was submitted on her behalf on February 23, 2024. Can you please remove her case from the deficiency list as well?

Thank you.

Melanie

60884	WILBURN, MELA	Submitted	2019-CV-06857
-------	---------------	-----------	---------------



Melanie Meneses Palmer  
Partner  
T: 310.854.4444  
F: 310.854.0812  
8648 Wilshire Blvd.  
Beverly Hills Ca, 90211

---

**From:** Garrett, Sean C. <[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)>

**Sent:** Friday, June 14, 2024 5:41 AM

**To:** Melanie Palmer <[palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)>

**Cc:** Sylvia Mendoza <[smendoza@kiesel.law](mailto:smendoza@kiesel.law)>; Christian Ceragioli <[cceragioli@kiesel.law](mailto:cceragioli@kiesel.law)>; Andrulyte, Emilija <[emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com](mailto:emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com)>

**Subject:** RE: MDL 2738: Talcum Powder Litigation- PPF Submissions

Hi Melanie,

Thanks for informing me the PPF was filed for this case. I will have this taken off my deficiency list and will not have it listed in the final dismissal order after the OTSC is entered.

Thanks

**Sean C. Garrett**

Associate

[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)

Connect: [vCard](#)

+1 973 549 7094 direct

---

**Faegre Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP**

600 Campus Dr.

Florham Park, New Jersey 07932, USA

This message and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and/or privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

---

**From:** Melanie Palmer <[palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, June 11, 2024 8:32 PM

**To:** Garrett, Sean C. <[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)>

**Cc:** Sylvia Mendoza <[smendoza@kiesel.law](mailto:smendoza@kiesel.law)>; Christian Ceragioli <[cceragioli@kiesel.law](mailto:cceragioli@kiesel.law)>; Friedman, Eric M. <[eric.friedman@faegredrinker.com](mailto:eric.friedman@faegredrinker.com)>; Andrulyte, Emilija <[emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com](mailto:emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com)>

**Subject:** RE: MDL 2738: Talcum Powder Litigation- PPF Submissions

**This Message originated outside your organization.**

---

Hi Sean,

Last week my office filed the Notice and Suggestion of Death concerning Ms. Marrache's passing, and we filed the Amended Complaint substituting the Special Administrator of her Estate and her children as plaintiffs. Accordingly, we have submitted via MDL Centrality the PPF declaration executed by the appointed Special Administrator. Can you confirm that this matter will be removed from the OSC list now that the PPF submission is complete?

Thank you.  
Melanie

MDL Centrality Plaintiff ID	Name	Status of PPF	Case Number
<a href="#">60930</a>	MARRACHE, FRIDA IVETTE	Submitted (verified); Amended Complaint filed	2019-CV-14337



Melanie Meneses Palmer  
Partner  
T: 310.854.4444  
F: 310.854.0812  
8648 Wilshire Blvd.  
Beverly Hills Ca, 90211

---

**From:** Garrett, Sean C. <[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)>

**Sent:** Thursday, May 30, 2024 8:59 AM

**To:** Melanie Palmer <[palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)>

**Cc:** Sylvia Mendoza <[smendoza@kiesel.law](mailto:smendoza@kiesel.law)>; Christian Ceragioli <[cceragioli@kiesel.law](mailto:cceragioli@kiesel.law)>; Haytham Faraj <[haytham@farajlaw.com](mailto:haytham@farajlaw.com)>; Arash Zabetian <[ahz@martinianlaw.com](mailto:ahz@martinianlaw.com)>; Tigran Martinian <[tm@martinianlaw.com](mailto:tm@martinianlaw.com)>; Anna M <[annam@martinianlaw.com](mailto:annam@martinianlaw.com)>; Friedman, Eric M. <[eric.friedman@faegredrinker.com](mailto:eric.friedman@faegredrinker.com)>; Andrulyte, Emilija <[emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com](mailto:emilija.andrulyte@faegredrinker.com)>

**Subject:** RE: MDL 2738: Talcum Powder Litigation- PPF Submissions

Hi Melanie,

For the plaintiffs you listed with verified PPFs, I can take those off my deficiency list.

For the plaintiffs who you submitted unverified PPFs for, I cannot agree to take those matters off my deficiency list. The Amended Plaintiff Profile Form Order requires a complete and verified PPF.

I will also note the Benson matter was already removed from my deficiency list for separate reasons.

Thank you,

**Sean C. Garrett**

Associate

[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)

Connect: [vCard](#)

+1 973 549 7094 direct

---

**[Faegre Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP](#)**

600 Campus Dr.

Florham Park, New Jersey 07932, USA

This message and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and/or privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

---

**From:** Melanie Palmer <[palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 29, 2024 3:25 PM

**To:** Garrett, Sean C. <[sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com](mailto:sean.garrett@faegredrinker.com)>; Friedman, Eric M. <[eric.friedman@faegredrinker.com](mailto:eric.friedman@faegredrinker.com)>; Kathleen A. Frazier (OA) <[KFRAZIER@shb.com](mailto:KFRAZIER@shb.com)>

**Cc:** Sylvia Mendoza <[smendoza@kiesel.law](mailto:smendoza@kiesel.law)>; Christian Ceragioli <[cceragioli@kiesel.law](mailto:cceragioli@kiesel.law)>; Haytham Faraj <[haytham@farajlaw.com](mailto:haytham@farajlaw.com)>; Arash Zabetian <[ahz@martinianlaw.com](mailto:ahz@martinianlaw.com)>; Tigran Martinian <[tm@martinianlaw.com](mailto:tm@martinianlaw.com)>; Anna M <[annam@martinianlaw.com](mailto:annam@martinianlaw.com)>

**Subject:** MDL 2738: Talcum Powder Litigation- PPF Submissions

**This Message originated outside your organization.**

---

Hi Sean,

I write to advise you that PPFs have been uploaded to MDL Centrality on behalf of all Plaintiffs listed below. Many were identified in Defendants' April 1, 2024 and May 1, 2024 Deficiency Letters to the Court. Yet, to date, none of these Plaintiffs have been listed on any of the Orders to Show Cause ("OSC") in regard to Plaintiff Profile Forms, and we provide this update to ensure that they are not included on any future OSC submissions.

As you will see, we uploaded complete and verified PPFs on behalf of the majority of Plaintiffs. Unfortunately, there are several Plaintiffs with whom my office has lost contact during the two-year bankruptcy stay. For these Plaintiffs, we have completed PPFs to the best of our ability and submitted them without the executed declarations. Despite many and thorough efforts by my team and

investigators, we have been unable to reach these Plaintiffs or their families. Therefore, we request an additional sixty (60) days to submit the executed declarations/amended PPFs as necessary for all Plaintiffs listed below whose PPF status indicates “Submitted (unverified).”

As to Plaintiff Ivette Frida Marrache (Case No. 2019-CV-14337), we learned that she passed away and have been working with her heirs to obtain Letters of Administration so that her matter can be continued through her heirs. A Nevada Probate Court just signed the Order Appointing Special Administrator on May 23, 2024. This week we will be filing an amended complaint in accordance with the Court’s Order Governing Amendments to Complaints dated October 10, 2023. Once the complaint has been amended, we will submit the PPF declaration executed by the appointed Special Administrator.

Should you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to contact me at any time.

Thank you,  
Melanie

MDL Centrality Plaintiff ID	Name	Status of PPF	Case Number
<a href="#">27906</a>	ADAMS, PATRICIA L	Submitted	2017-CV-11455
<a href="#">67520</a>	BROCK, LATISHA	Submitted	2019-CV-17168
<a href="#">2053</a>	BROWDER, ALMA D	Submitted	2018-CV-03102
<a href="#">60527</a>	CARPENTER, KELLY	Submitted	2018-CV-3106
<a href="#">67596</a>	CORDER, JAMIE	Submitted	2019-CV-16476
<a href="#">66108</a>	DAZEN, JEANETTE	Submitted	2019-CV-17587
<a href="#">60881</a>	DETAR, EVELYN	Submitted	2019-CV-18074
<a href="#">67603</a>	FRASER, NICHOLE	Submitted	2020-CV-13545
<a href="#">67595</a>	FULTON, HOLLI	Submitted	2019-CV-13915
<a href="#">60819</a>	GOULD, DELPHINA	Submitted	2019-CV-06856
<a href="#">2052</a>	GRAYSON, REBECCA	Submitted	2019-CV-06854
<a href="#">67523</a>	GUINN, LINDA	Submitted	2019-CV-17588
<a href="#">60543</a>	HAYES, SHARON	Submitted	2019-CV-13899
<a href="#">67601</a>	HYLAND, CHERYL	Submitted	2019-CV-18885
<a href="#">60529</a>	KIRKENDALL, JUDY	Submitted	2018-CV-3101
<a href="#">27974</a>	KRAJCIK, NANCY	Submitted	2018-CV-00982
<a href="#">66116</a>	LADNER, TONIA	Submitted	2019-CV-13439
<a href="#">26083</a>	LANDES, CYNTHIA	Submitted	2017-CV-11456
<a href="#">26816</a>	LAPERRE, BERNADINA M	Submitted	2017-CV-11457
<a href="#">67600</a>	LONG, LINDA	Submitted	2019-CV-17530
<a href="#">67767</a>	MARSHALL, SANDRA	Submitted	2021-CV-18639
<a href="#">60534</a>	MARTINEZ, ORALIA	Submitted	2018-CV-3108
<a href="#">60882</a>	MCCLINTOCK, VIRGINIA	Submitted	2019-CV-15392



67599	MOON-GAINES, HELEN	Submitted	2019-CV-16382
<u>67605</u>	OATIS, BARBARA	Submitted	2019-CV-13913
<u>2014</u>	OVERSTREET, VIVIAN	Submitted	2019-CV-15007
<u>24472</u>	PERAULT, JOANNE L	Submitted	2021-CV-01146
<u>60883</u>	SANCHEZ, YVONNE	Submitted	2019-CV-14419
<u>60822</u>	WILKINSON, JOSEPHINE	Submitted	2019-CV-19264
<u>46129</u>	ZOELLER, CYNTHIA	Submitted	2017-CV-11459
<u>66234</u>	BENSON, MERRITT	Submitted (unverified)	2017-CV-07188
<u>66111</u>	JAMES, RHONDA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-14421
<u>66117</u>	LAFRANCE, EULA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-06853
<u>67593</u>	LOO-LEW, CAROLINE	Submitted (unverified)	2020-CV-00584
<u>60930</u>	MARRACHE, FRIDA IVETTE	Submitted (unverified) Pending substitution of Plaintiff by successors	2019-CV-14337
<u>66239</u>	MEDINA, ROSA MONICA SERNA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-21076
<u>67301</u>	MENDOZA, MARIA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-17533
<u>67302</u>	MITCHELL, JANE	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-15425
<u>66240</u>	MOINA, JANET	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-17586
<u>66241</u>	PEREZ, SYLVIA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-21337
<u>67400</u>	RADBILL, NATALIE	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-16389
<u>67817</u>	ROBERTS, AUDREY	Submitted (unverified)	2018-CV-03105
<u>67292</u>	SENA-HERNANDEZ, CHRISTINA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-16241
<u>66107</u>	SIMMONS, TAMMY	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-17939
<u>66235</u>	SOGUILON, RUTHANN	Submitted (unverified)	2018-CV-03103
<u>67589</u>	VINES, TERESA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-17534
<u>67524</u>	WALLACE, PANILLA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-17589
<u>67586</u>	WHITEHEAD, AMELIA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-21318
<u>60884</u>	WILBURN, MELA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-06857
<u>67304</u>	WILLIAMS, SUZANNA	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-13438
<u>67303</u>	WORLEY, DOROTHY	Submitted (unverified)	2019-CV-17932



Melanie Meneses Palmer  
Partner  
T: 310.854.4444  
F: 310.854.0812  
8648 Wilshire Blvd.  
Beverly Hills Ca, 90211

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on September 5, 2024, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive services in this MDL.

Dated: September 5, 2024

Respectfully Submitted,

By: /s/ Melanie Meneses Palmer

Melanie Meneses Palmer  
KIESEL LAW LLP  
8648 Wilshire Boulevard  
Beverly Hills, California 90211  
Tel. (310) 854-4444  
Fax (310) 854-0812  
E-mail: [palmer@kiesel.law](mailto:palmer@kiesel.law)

*Counsel for Plaintiff*